

# United States Patent and Trademark Office

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.	
10/700,352	11/03/2003	Subir Varma	164.1013.07	5252	
22883	7590 09/07/2004		EXAM	TNER	
SWERNOFSKY LAW GROUP PC			TSE, YOUNG TOI		
P.O. BOX 390	0013 VIEW, CA 94039-0013		ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER	
MOUNTAIN	VIEW, CA 74037-0013		2637	2637	

DATE MAILED: 09/07/2004

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

0
ı

		Application No.	Applicant(s)					
Office Action Summary		10/700,352	VARMA ET AL.					
		Examiner	Art Unit					
		YOUNG T. TSE	2637					
Period fo	The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address Period for Reply							
A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.  - Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.  - If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.  - If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.  - Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133).  Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).								
Status								
1)⊠	1) Responsive to communication(s) filed on <u>03 November 2003</u> .							
2a) <u></u> □	This action is <b>FINAL</b> . 2b)⊠ This	This action is <b>FINAL</b> . 2b)⊠ This action is non-final.						
3)□	Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is							
	closed in accordance with the practice under E	Ex parte Quayle, 19	35 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.					
Disposition of Claims								
4)⊠	Claim(s) 1-9,11-19,21-29 and 31 is/are pendin	g in the application						
	4a) Of the above claim(s) is/are withdrawn from consideration.							
5)⊠	Claim(s) <u>1-9,11-19 and 21</u> is/are allowed.							
6)🖾	Claim(s) 31 is/are rejected.							
	Claim(s) 22-29 is/are objected to.							
8)	Claim(s) are subject to restriction and/o	r election requirem	ent.					
Applicati	on Papers							
9) The specification is objected to by the Examiner.								
10) 🔲 🤈	10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.							
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).								
	Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).							
11) 🔲	11) The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.							
Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119								
<ul> <li>12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).</li> <li>a) All b) Some * c) None of:</li> <li>1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.</li> <li>2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No.</li> <li>3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).</li> </ul>								
* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.								
Attachment(s)								
	e of References Cited (PTO-892)	4) 🔲 Int	erview Summary (PTO-413)					
	e of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)	<b>—</b> Pa	per No(s)/Mail Date	150)				
Paper	nation Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08) No(s)/Mail Date		ptice of Informal Patent Application (PTC her:	J-+ <del>0</del> 2)				

Application/Control Number: 10/700,352

Art Unit: 2637

#### **DETAILED ACTION**

Page 2

### Claim Objections

1. Claims 22-29 are objected to because of the following informalities: in line 1 of claims 22 and 25-28, "claim 1" should be "claim 21"; in line 1 of claims 23-24, "claim 2" should be "claim 22"; and in claim 29, line 1, "claim 8" should be "claim 28". Appropriate correction is required.

## **Double Patenting**

2. The nonstatutory double patenting rejection is based on a judicially created doctrine grounded in public policy (a policy reflected in the statute) so as to prevent the unjustified or improper timewise extension of the "right to exclude" granted by a patent and to prevent possible harassment by multiple assignees. See *In re Goodman*, 11 F.3d 1046, 29 USPQ2d 2010 (Fed. Cir. 1993); *In re Longi*, 759 F.2d 887, 225 USPQ 645 (Fed. Cir. 1985); *In re Van Ornum*, 686 F.2d 937, 214 USPQ 761 (CCPA 1982); *In re Vogel*, 422 F.2d 438, 164 USPQ 619 (CCPA 1970);and, *In re Thorington*, 418 F.2d 528, 163 USPQ 644 (CCPA 1969).

A timely filed terminal disclaimer in compliance with 37 CFR 1.321(c) may be used to overcome an actual or provisional rejection based on a nonstatutory double patenting ground provided the conflicting application or patent is shown to be commonly owned with this application. See 37 CFR 1.130(b).

Effective January 1, 1994, a registered attorney or agent of record may sign a terminal disclaimer. A terminal disclaimer signed by the assignee must fully comply with 37 CFR 3.73(b).

3. Claim 31 is rejected under the judicially created doctrine of double patenting over claim 28 of U. S. Patent No. 6,643,322 since the claims, if allowed, would improperly extend the "right to exclude" already granted in the patent.

The subject matter claimed in the instant application is fully disclosed in the patent and is covered by the patent since the patent and the application are claiming common subject matter, as follows: although claim 31 of the instant application includes the additional word "continuously" determining a measure of errors occurring in

Application/Control Number: 10/700,352 Page 3

Art Unit: 2637

communication over a wireless link over claim 28 of U. S. Patent No. 6,643,322. It is obvious to a person skill in the art that additional correction (continuously) is necessary if the measurement of errors has not been completely corrected.

Furthermore, there is no apparent reason why applicant was prevented from presenting claims corresponding to those of the instant application during prosecution of the application which matured into a patent. See *In re Schneller*, 397 F.2d 350, 158 USPQ 210 (CCPA 1968). See also MPEP § 804.

#### Allowable Subject Matter

- 4. Claims 1-9, 11-19 and 21 are allowed.
- 5. Claims 22-29 would be allowable if rewritten or amended to overcome the objections set forth in this Office action.
- 6. Claim 31 would be allowable if submit a terminal disclaimer to overcome the double patenting set forth in this Office action.
- 7. The following is a statement of reasons for the indication of allowable subject matter: the prior art fails to show or suggest a method or apparatus that dynamically adapts plural set of wireless link parameters, wherein each set of wireless link parameters corresponds to a relationship between throughput efficiency and error rate and a plurality of predetermined thresholds is used to correspond to intersection of the relationship for different set of wireless link parameters.

Application/Control Number: 10/700,352 Page 4

Art Unit: 2637

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to YOUNG T. TSE whose telephone number is (571) 272-3051. The examiner can normally be reached on Tuesday-Friday.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Jay Patel can be reached on (571) 272-2988. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 703-872-9306.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see http://pair-direct.uspto.gov. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

YOUNG T. TSE
Primary Examiner
Art Unit 2637